1	ANTIBIOTIC RESISTANCE IN Escherichia coli IN HUSBANDRY ANIMALS. THE AFRICAN
2	PERSPECTIVE.
3	
4	Carla Andrea Alonso <sup>a</sup> , Myriam Zarazaga <sup>a</sup> , Rym Ben Sallem <sup>b</sup> , Ahlem Jouini <sup>c</sup> , Karim
5	Ben Slama <sup>b</sup> , Carmen Torres <sup>a*</sup>
6	<sup>a</sup> Área Bioquímica y Biología Molecular, Universidad de La Rioja, Logroño, Spain.
7	<sup>b</sup> Faculté des Sciences de Tunis, Laboratoire des Microorganismes et Biomolécules
8	Actives, Université de Tunis El Manar, Tunis, Tunisia.
9	<sup>c</sup> Laboratoire d'Épidémiologie et Microbiologie Vétérinaire. Institut Pasteur de Tunis,
10	Université de Tunis El Manar, Tunis, Tunisia.
11	
12	
13	Running headline: Resistant E. coli in African livestock
14	
15	*Corresponding author. +34 941 299750
16	<i>E-mail address</i> : <u>carmen.torres@unirioja.es</u> (C. Torres)
17	Full postal address: Madre de Dios 51, 26006 Logroño, Spain. Área Bioquímica y
18	Biología Molecular. Universidad de La Rioja.
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	

#### 27 SUMMARY (150-200 word)

28 In the last few years different surveillances have been published in Africa, especially in Northern countries, 29 regarding antimicrobial resistance among husbandry animals. Information is still scarce, but the available 30 data shows a worrying picture. Although the highest resistance rates have been described against 31 tetracycline, penicillins and sulphonamides, prevalence of plasmid mediated quinolone resistance genes 32 and extended-spectrum  $\beta$ -lactamase (ESBL) are being increasingly reported. Among ESBLs, the CTX-M-33 1 group was dominant in most African surveys. Within this group, CTX-M-15 was the main variant both 34 in animals and humans, except in Tunisia where CTX-M-1 was more frequently detected among E. coli 35 from poultry. Certain *bla*<sub>CTX-M-15</sub>-harboring clones (ST131/B2 or ST405/D) are mainly identified in humans 36 but they have also been reported in livestock species from Tanzania, Nigeria or Tunisia. Moreover, several 37 reports suggest an inter-host circulation of specific plasmids (e.g. *bla*<sub>CTX-M-1</sub>-carrying IncI1/ST3 in Tunisia, IncY and Inc-untypeable replicons co-harboring qnrS1 and bla<sub>CTX-M-15</sub> in Tanzania and the worldwide 38 39 distributed *bla*<sub>CTX-M-15</sub>-carrying IncF-type plasmids). International trade of poultry meat seems to have 40 contributed to the spread of other ESBL variants, such as CTX-M-14, and clones. Furthermore, first 41 descriptions of OXA-48 and OXA-181-producing E. coli have been recently documented in cattle from 42 Egypt, and the emergent plasmid-mediated colistin resistance mcr-1 gene has been also identified in 43 chickens from Algeria, Tunisia and South Africa. These data reflect the urgent need of a larger regulation 44 in the use of veterinary drugs and the implementation of surveillances programmes in order to decelerate 45 the advance of antimicrobial resistance in this continent.

46 Keywords: *Escherichia coli*, antibiotic resistance, β-lactamases, husbandry animals, Africa.

47

#### 48 INTRODUCTION

49 The rapid increase in the rate of antimicrobial-resistant bacteria (AMR) reinforced by the opposite tendency 50 in the development of new active drugs is currently one of the most serious public health threats, as 51 recognized World Health Organization (Accessed 26/11/2016 by the 52 http://www.who.int/drugresistance/documents/surveillancereport/en). Resistance trends in Gram-negative 53 bacilli are particularly alarming due to limited antibiotic options to treat infections caused by some 54 organisms (especially Enterobacteriaceae, Pseudomonas aeruginosa and Acinetobacter) that are becoming 55 resistant to nearly all available antimicrobials, including carbapenems.

56 This global emergence of multi-drug resistant bacteria has been attributed to the overuse and misuse of 57 antibiotics, not only in human medicine but also in farming and veterinary sectors. In fact, the worldwide 58 use of antibiotics for animal health and production purposes exceeds the use in humans and most of the 59 drugs designed exclusively for veterinary use are closely related or belong to the same antimicrobial classes 60 of those indicated for humans (Aaerstrup et al. 2008; Cantas et al. 2013). In Europe, according to the data 61 from 10 countries, the amount of veterinary antimicrobial agents sold in 2007 varied from 18 to 188 mg/kg 62 biomass of food-producing animals (FPA), and were globally predominant the sales of sulphonamides and 63 trimethoprim (alone or in combination), tetracyclines and  $\beta$ -lactams (Grave *et al.* 2010). In Japan, the 64 amounts varied between 132 mg/kg and 153 mg/kg from 2005 to 2010 (Hosoi et al. 2013). In general, in 65 developed countries the use of antibiotics is strictly controlled and documented, but this is not the case in 66 developing countries of the African continent where veterinary antimicrobials are often readily sold in 67 shops and markets without prescriptions (Mainda et al. 2015).

68 Unfortunately, as expected, it has been demonstrated that the use of antimicrobial agents in husbandry is 69 directly related to the incidence of resistant bacteria in FPA (Baron *et al.* 2014, Chantziaras *et al.* 2014). 70 Selection of these antimicrobial resistant (AMR) bacteria that asymptomatically colonize the gut of animals 71 might play an epidemiological role in the spread of resistance between FPA and humans, either through 72 direct contact or consumption of contaminated food. Inter-host transmission is more likely to happen in 73 rural areas of developing countries with mainly subsistence-based agricultural economies, such as some 74 regions in Africa, where people frequently live in close contact with livestock animals.

75 Because of the growing problem of antibiotic resistance worldwide, the number of studies focusing on the 76 epidemiology of AMR bacteria, with special attention to extended-spectrum beta-lactamase (ESBL), 77 plasmidic AmpC beta-lactamase (pAmpC) and carbapenemase-production in Enterobacteriaceae, has 78 increased over the last few years. The majority of these reports have been carried out in Escherichia coli, 79 generally considered a useful indicator of antimicrobial resistance due to its medical importance and its 80 presence in a wide range of hosts. This allows comparisons of prevalence between different populations 81 and the evaluation of antimicrobial resistance transmission from animals to humans and vice versa (van der 82 Bogaard and Stobberingh 2000). Despite limited resources, the incidence of AMR Enterobacteriaceae in 83 Africa, and more specifically ESBL producers, has been also studied at the local level in different countries. 84 There are also some reviews about the general situation in the whole continent but most of them are 85 concentrated in human clinical and community settings (Storberg, 2012; Sangare et al. 2015, Sekyere et al.

86 2016). In the present review, we aim to describe the situation of AMR E. coli in FPA and food of animal

87 origin in Africa, with particular focus on ESBL/pAmpC producing isolates.

88

#### 89 LITERATURE SEARCH STRATEGY AND DATA EXTRACTION

90 A literature search was conducted in PubMed database for original articles reporting data on AMR E. coli 91 from African countries. The review was limited to studies published in English between January 2007 and 92 November 2016. We used combinations of relevant keywords such as: A) "Escherichia coli"; B) 93 "antimicrobial resistance", "antibiotic resistance", "antimicrobial usage", "antibiotic usage", "ESBL", 94 "extended-spectrum beta-lactamases", "carbapenemases"; C) General ("livestock animals", "farm 95 animals", "husbandry", "food-producing animals") and specific animal descriptors (eg, "poultry", 96 "chickens", "swine", "pigs", "cattle") ; D) "Africa" and the names of each African nation. References of 97 articles were reviewed to identify any other relevant publication and, additionally, an online search was 98 carried out to consult documents from International Organizations (e.g., WHO, OIE).

99 The first author, country, year of sampling, sample type, sample size, animal health status, prevalence and 100 distribution of antimicrobial resistance, resistance genes/mechanisms and molecular typing data were 101 extracted from all the included studies.

102

## 103 ANTIMICROBIAL USAGE IN LIVESTOCK AND RESISTANCE PATTERNS IN E. coli

104 Antimicrobial agents can be used in animal husbandry not only for the treatment and prevention of 105 infectious diseases but also, at low and sub-therapeutic doses, as growth promoters. Although their use 106 allows to protect animal health and welfare with lower incidence of disease and also contributes to food 107 safety, there is evidence to suggest that are leading to the spread of antimicrobial resistance (Chantziaras et 108 al. 2014) with important public health implications. In this sense, on the basis of precautionary principles, 109 European Union banned in 2006 the use of all growth-promoting antibiotics (Hao et al. 2014). 110 Unfortunately, this preventive measure has not been taken all over the world, and antimicrobial agents are 111 still used for this purpose in many developed and developing countries.

In general, the use and control of antimicrobials in the developing world, including countries of the African continent, remains largely unregulated (Maron *et al.* 2013). According to The World Organisation for Animal Health (Accessed 26/11/2016 <u>http://www.oie.int/</u>) in many countries, mainly developing and emerging ones, do not yet have relevant legislation concerning appropriate conditions for the use of 116 veterinary products, including antimicrobials. In some cases, legislation is totally non-existent and where 117 it does exist it is very often not properly applied. As some African studies focused on the antimicrobial 118 usage in livestock indicate, there is an irrational use due to the unregulated access and even administration 119 of veterinary drugs (Adesokan et al. 2015; Eagar et al. 2012; Mainda et al. 2015). Even though in many 120 African countries it is illegal for any person who is not a registered veterinarian to administer antibiotics, 121 there are no strict control measures and often farmers purchase and administer a drug without veterinary 122 prescription and supervision (Adesokan et al. 2015, Mainda et al. 2015). Unfortunately, the use of antimicrobials in animals by untrained personnel is not confined to developing and emerging countries 123 124 (Accessed 26/11/2016 http://www.oie.int/).

125 Furthermore, it is also important to note that the first study estimating the global trends in antimicrobial use 126 in livestock production found that the global consumption of antimicrobials will increase in the future and 127 this rise is likely to be driven by the growth in consumer demand for livestock products in middle-income 128 countries and a shift to large-scale farms where antimicrobials are used routinely (Van Boeckel et al. 2015). 129 The data of different surveys conducted in Nigeria (Adesokan et al. 2015), Zambia (Mainda et al. 2015) 130 and South Africa (Eager et al. 2012) about the sales of antimicrobials for farm animals indicate that, even 131 considering variations between countries or animal species (mammals or poultry), tetracyclines and beta-132 lactams (mainly penicillins) are among the first four leading antibiotics commonly employed in livestock 133 animal production. Sulphonamides and macrolides are also frequently consumed antimicrobials, this last 134 group (with reference specifically to tylosin) has been reported as the most extensively sold in South Africa 135 for treatment and prevention of veterinary diseases and also, at sub-therapeutic levels, as a registered growth 136 promoter (Eager et al. 2012). Equally worrisome is the veterinary overuse of fluoroquinolones (critically 137 important in human medicine) in some African regions, as it has been documented in a survey conducted 138 in south-western Nigeria (Adesokan et al. 2015).

In a study carried out in Ghana, 395 commercial livestock keepers who practice intensive or extensive farming were interviewed about their antibiotic usage practice (Donkor *et al.* 2012). Most of the farmers used veterinary drugs mainly for disease prevention, followed by the dual purpose of prevention and treatment, only treatment and, less often, also for growth promotion. Of course, it is important to mention that the data collected from livestock keepers were self-reported, which may pose certain limitations. Another significant aspect to consider is the antibiotic administration bias commonly employed in livestock production, which is obviously different from those used in human medicine. A survey conducted in South Africa showed that in-feed dosage forms constituted almost 70% of the total of antimicrobial dosages sold
in this country (Eager *et al.* 2012). This practice favors that an entire group of animals be medicated at the
same time contrary to the individual treatment given to patients.

149 Moreover, recent data from Nigeria show a significant increasing trend in the veterinary antimicrobial 150 consumption, which is not proportional to the annual livestock rate in the area (Adesokan et al. 2015). 151 Regarding the type of livestock species, some studies suggest a relatively higher rate of antimicrobial usage 152 among chickens, which is expressed in the more elevated percentage of resistant isolates detected among 153 this particular animal population (Ben Sallem et al. 2012b, Donkor et al. 2012, Adenipekun et al. 2015). A 154 European report based on data gathered from seven countries also showed higher resistance rates in poultry 155 (Chantziaras et al. 2014). This may be explained, in part, by the fact that antibiotic usage is even higher in 156 intensive farming, more common in poultry, where animals are reared in close proximity.

157 In general, although resistance percentages vary significantly among regions and studied animal 158 populations, the highest rates have been reported for tetracycline (10.6%-95%), ampicillin (6.02%-95.7%) 159 and trimethoprim/sulfamethoxazole (4.49%-80%) (Wesonga et al. 2010, Donkor et al. 2012, Adelowo et 160 al. 2014, Adenipekun et al. 2015, Mainda et al. 2015, Rugumisa et al. 2016). African studies on food of 161 animal origin (retail chicken or turkey meat, beef and pork carcasses) also report that resistance levels to 162 these antimicrobials are among the most relevant ones (Soufi et al. 2009; Odwar et al. 2014; Luanda et al. 163 2016; Mrutu et al. 2016). This is not surprising since these drugs have been in use the longest time both in 164 human and veterinary medicine (Tadesse et al. 2012). Their combined resistance, often due to the co-165 location of different determinants in the same mobile genetic elements (plasmids, transposons and/or 166 integrons) has contributed to the selection of multi-drug resistant (MDR) isolates worldwide (Wesonga et 167 al. 2010, Tadesse et al. 2012, Adenipekun et al. 2015). The presence and diversity of integrons in E. coli 168 from poultry, poultry meat and cattle have been studied in various reports from Africa (Soufi et al. 2009, 169 Ben Slama et al. 2010, Inwezerua et al. 2014, Maamar et al. 2016) and showed high rates of prevalence of 170 class 1 and class 2 integrons (60%) containing, as commonly occur, trimethoprim (dfr) and streptomycin 171 (aad) resistance encoding genes.

Regarding other antimicrobial classes, such as quinolones and cephalosporins, the picture is even more worrying due to their vital importance in the treatment of a wide variety of infections in humans and the fact that resistance against them leaves few therapy options. Livestock as reservoirs of ESBL-producer bacteria will be discussed in the following sections because of its relevance in terms of emerging resistance 176 properties and the substantial literature available. Some studies performed in Tunisia and Nigeria reported 177 unexpected high prevalence of resistance to quinolones among cattle (61.2%) (Grami et al. 2014) and 178 poultry (42-55%) (Fortini et al. 2011, Adelowo et al. 2014), since this antimicrobial class was introduced 179 later than others in livestock and is relatively expensive. Resistance to quinolones and fluoroquinolones is 180 mainly driven by chromosomal mutations at the quinolone resistance determining region (QRDR) of DNA 181 gyrase and topoisomerase IV. However, plasmid-mediated quinolones resistance mechanisms (PMQR) 182 (such as, *qnr* proteins, *aac*(6)-*Ib*-*cr* aminoglycoside acetyltransferase and efflux pump proteins like QepA 183 or OqxAB) have been progressively detected and contribute to an increase in the MIC of quinolones and 184 fluoroquinolones. In Nigeria, a country where previous studies had reported a high prevalence of PMQR 185 genes in clinical samples from humans (Ogbolu et al. 2011), an important study was carried out in poultry 186 and pigs to characterize PMQR determinants and associated plasmids and clones (Fortini et al. 2011). The 187 resulting data, which identified four PMQR gene variants (qnrB10, qnrB19, qnrS1 and qepA1) located on 188 five different plasmid types (IncHI2, ColE, IncI1, IncN and IncX2), suggested that FPA can act as reservoirs 189 of PMQR determinants. In particular, this work demonstrated the wide circulation in the area of qnrS1 gene 190 harbored mainly in IncX2, IncN and IncI1 plasmids, qnrB19 in small ColE-like plasmids and qepA1 in 191 plasmids of HI2 incompatibility group. Moreover, the same IncI1-ST12 plasmid harboring qnrS1 was 192 detected in commensal E. coli isolates from poultry in the mentioned study and in Salmonella strains in 193 other independent work carried out previously in Nigeria (Fashae et al. 2010). Regarding other remarkable 194 aspect of this study, all the strains carried the  $bla_{\text{TEM-1}}$  gene and one was positive for CTX-M-15 beta-195 lactamase. In fact, association between qnr or aac(6)Ib-cr and bla genes has been frequently reported 196 worldwide, including some African countries (Mnif et al. 2012, Ben Sallem et al. 2014, Inwezerua et al. 197 2014, Kilani et al. 2015, Belmahdi et al. 2016, Ojo et al. 2016, Seni et al. 2016).

198 It is also important to highlight the detection of E. coli isolates carrying the emerging plasmid-mediated 199 colistin resistance gene mcr-1 in chickens from Algeria (Olaitan et al. 2016), South Africa (Perreten et al. 200 2016) and three poultry farms from Tunisia (Grami et al. 2016). Tunisian isolates, collected from chickens 201 imported from France, were further characterized and demonstrated to carry blacTX-M-1 and mcr-1 genes co-202 localised on the same IncHI2-type plasmid. This plasmid was also found in veal calves in France (Haenni 203 et al. 2016) and food samples in Portugal (Tse et al. 2016), highlighting the impact of food animal trade on 204 the dissemination of mcr-1-mediated colistin resistance. This polymyxin is currently considered a last-205 resort antibiotic for the treatment of highly resistant pathogenic bacteria in human medicine. However, it has been also extensively used in animal production worldwide (Rhouma *et al.* 2016) leading to a potential
selection of resistant strains which reflects, once again, the urgent need of a better control in the global
market of veterinary drugs.

209 Regarding surveillances performed on specific pathogenic strains, such as Shiga-toxin producing 210 Escherichia coli O157, a high prevalence of MDR isolates (>90%) were reported in two studies conducted 211 in South Africa (Ateba and Bezuidenhout 2008, Iweriebor et al. 2015). In both cases, elevated rates of 212 resistance against sulphametoxazol and tetracycline were reported, but even more alarming was the 213 detection of blacTX-M and blacMY genes encoding third-generation cephalosporin resistance (Iweriebor et al. 214 2015). Healthy domestic ruminants, particularly cattle and sheep, are considered natural reservoirs of these 215 pathogens, associated to clinical diseases such as diarrhea, haemorrhagic colitis or haemolytic uraemic 216 syndrome in humans. Thus, indirect selection of MDR isolates can contribute to an emergence of 217 pathogenic strains posing a risk to public health.

218

# 219 ESBL, PLASMID-MEDIATED AMPC AND CARBAPENEMASE PRODUCING E. coli IN

#### 220 HUSBANDRY ANIMALS

The first description of ESBL-producing *Escherichia coli* from livestock origin in the African continent
dates back to 2011 (Fortini *et al.* 2011). Since then, many surveillance reports have been published,
especially in Northern Africa, reflecting an increased effort to understand the role of animals as reservoirs
of ESBL and establish good control measures to avoid the spread of these bacteria.

225 Regarding data from Table 1, which collects all the published studies on ESBL-producing E. coli among 226 African livestock and derived-food, the prevalence of these resistant bacteria among healthy animals was 227 highly variable depending on the study (from 0% to 42.8%). This variability can be explained, in part, to 228 differences in the methodology used. Of course, other factors like specific selective driving forces 229 (antimicrobial usage), farming practices, geographical particularities such as the predominance of specific 230 clones, and even the studied animal breed (local/exotic) or age have demonstrated to affect the carriage 231 percentages of ESBL among animals (Reist et al. 2013, Seni et al. 2016). It is also important to mention 232 that most of the surveys were carried out among poultry in comparison with other FPA species such as 233 cattle or pigs. Although the vast majority of analyzed samples were faeces, one study conducted in Algeria 234 (not considered in the previously given prevalence estimation because of the small number of samples 235 included) reported the presence of ESBL-E.coli in the reproductive and gastrointestinal tract of 9 broiler breeding roosters (Mezhoud *et al.* 2015). Considering the few data available on diseased animal population
(Table 2), the number of studies among cattle and poultry is more homogeneous and mainly focused on
chickens suffering from colibacillosis and cattle with clinical or subclinical mastitis. The prevalence of
ESBL-producing *E. coli* among sick poultry varied from 0 to 24.7% and for cattle was reported between 0
and 10% (although the number of studied *E. coli* strains was considerably lower in cattle).

241 Focusing on the diversity of ESBL enzymes among E. coli isolates from African livestock, those belonging 242 to CTX-M-1 group have demonstrated to be more abundant than other ESBL groups or types (SHV or TEM 243 ESBLs). In the majority of the surveys, *bla*<sub>CTX-M-15</sub> was the most common ESBL gene detected with the 244 exception of Tunisia, where many works reported CTX-M-1 as the main enzyme among poultry (Ben 245 Sallem et al. 2012b, Mnif et al. 2012, Maamar et al. 2016) (Fig. 1A). In Tunisia, CTX-M-1 has also been 246 found as the most prevalent variant among ESBL-producing E. coli of healthy humans' intestinal 247 microbiota (Ben Sallem et al. 2012a), whereas CTX-M-15 is the predominant enzyme among clinical 248 ESBL-producer isolates (Dahmen et al. 2010, Ben Slama et al. 2011). In fact, bla<sub>CTX-M-15</sub> is in general the 249 most frequently found ESBL gene among African hospital strains, regardless of the country (Storberg 250 2014). In Algeria, a study carried out in slaughtered broilers showed a high prevalence of  $bla_{SHV-12}$ 251 (Belmahdi et al. 2016). However, most of the isolates carrying this bla gene were taken from chickens 252 belonging to the same farm and showed equal sequence type, suggesting a possible spread of a specific 253 clone in this farm more than a picture of the situation in the country. It is also remarkable, the high rate of 254 plasmid AmpC (pAmpC) beta-lactamase, belonging in all cases to CMY-2 variant, identified among 255 commensal E. coli from healthy chickens in Tunisia (Ben Sallem et al. 2012b, Mnif et al. 2012, Maamar et 256 al. 2016), Algeria (Belmahdi et al. 2016) and septicemic broilers in Egypt (Ahmed et al. 2013). CMY-2, 257 together with DHA-1, is the most frequently detected pAmpC variant among human clinical isolates in 258 Africa (Storberg 2014).

Considering carbapenemase production among *E. coli* isolates in the African continent, although many
descriptions have been reported in humans (Robin *et al.* 2010, Moquet *et al.* 2011, Barguigua *et al.* 2013,
Leski *et al.* 2013, Mushi *et al.* 2014) and the hospital environment (Chouchani *et al.* 2011) over the last
five years, it has not been until very recently when the first carbapenemase-producing *E. coli* was detected
in pets (Yousfi *et al.* 2016) and livestock animals (Braun *et al.* 2016). This last study, conducted in different
dairy cattle farms from Egypt, reported 4 *E. coli* strains harboring *bla*<sub>OXA-48</sub> and one carrying *bla*<sub>OXA-181</sub>
carbapenemase genes, all of them phenotypically resistant to meropenem and imipenem. It is also important

to mention the detection of an ertapenem-resistant ESBL-*E. coli* strain in a chicken from Nigeria. However,
no carbapenemase was detected in this strain. The resistant phenotype was attributed to a synergistic effect
between CTX-M-15 production and dysfunctionality of outer membrane proteins (Ojo *et al.* 2015).

269 Although CTX-M-15 was the predominant ESBL enzyme detected among livestock in many African 270 countries such as Nigeria, Tanzania or Egypt, only in two surveillances this bla gene was shown to be 271 associated with the human epidemic clone ST131. These ST131-CTX-M-15-producing E. coli isolates were 272 identified in a healthy swine from Tanzania (Seni et al. 2016) and the blood of 3 septicemic broilers from 273 Egypt (Ahmed et al. 2013). ST405-D strains, which have also been considered vehicles driving CTX-M-274 15 worldwide and are frequently associated with clinical conditions in humans (Ben Slama et al. 2011, 275 Alghoribi et al. 2015, Day et al. 2016), were also identified among healthy chickens and cattle in Tunisia 276 and Nigeria, respectively. Other clones, such as those belonging to ST10 Complex (ST10 or ST617), are 277 equally highly distributed among various livestock species and humans in many African countries like 278 Nigeria (Aibinu et al. 2012, Ojo et al. 2016) or Tanzania (Mshana et al. 2016, Seni et al. 2016). Concerning 279 the distribution of ESBL/pAmpC producing *E. coli* strains according to the major phylogenetic groups (A, 280 B1, B2, D), the majority of the studies showed a dominance of phylogroups A and B1 over isolates from 281 healthy FPA and derived meat (Ben Slama et al., 2010, Schaumburg et al. 2014, Abdallah et al. 2015, 282 Rasmussen et al. 2015, Maamar et al. 2016, Seni et al. 2016). Although phylogroup D has also been 283 detected quite frequently among ESBL/AmpC producers from healthy poultry (Mnif et al. 2012), 284 phylogroup B2 was present at lower rates in all the studies considered in this review. Regarding publications 285 on diseased animals, few of them provide a phylogenetic analysis of the ESBL isolates, making it difficult 286 to generalize.

287 However, epidemiology of ESBL involves not only a clonal spread of bacteria but also the horizontal 288 transfer of *bla* genes via plasmids and/or other transferable genetic structures. In this sense, although 289 molecular information on mobile elements is scarce in Africa, there are some works that prove the 290 importance of specific plasmids in the geographical and even interspecies dissemination of ESBL 291 determinants (Grami et al. 2015, Ojo et al. 2016, Seni et al. 2016). In this regard, as it has been previously 292 shown in other continents, the dominance of IncF-type plasmids carrying the bla<sub>CTX-M-15</sub> gene among E. coli 293 from human and animal origin has been also reported in Africa (Grami et al. 2014, Ojo et al. 2016, Seni et 294 al. 2016). But this emergent CTX-M-15 encoding gene has been also associated with other less common 295 replicon plasmids such as IncY-type, which have shown to be very prevalent in animal isolates from 296 Tanzania. Interestingly, in the same surveillance, the presence of an Inc-untypeable plasmid, co-harboring 297 *bla*<sub>CTX-M-15</sub> and *qnrS1* genes and genetically homologous to a previously described one from human origin 298 in Nigeria, was detected in various animals. In Tunisia, where CTX-M-1 enzyme is broadly disseminated 299 among poultry, two molecular studies confirmed its frequent association with IncI1/ST3 plasmids (Grami 300 et al. 2014; Ben Sallem et al. 2014). One of these surveys showed a comparison of clonal lineages and 301 plasmids from healthy humans, animals and pets in Tunisia and demonstrated that bla<sub>CTX-M-1</sub>-carrying 302 IncI1/ST3 plasmids and bla<sub>CMY-2</sub> –carrying IncI1/ST12 plasmids play a crucial role in the spread of these 303  $\beta$ -lactamases among different host and ecosystems (Ben Sallem *et al.* 2014). Likewise, the other work 304 concluded that examined *bla*<sub>CTX-M-1</sub>-harboring IncI1/ST3 plasmids of *E. coli* from Tunisian poultry and 305 pets were identical or highly similar to those reported in various animal species in Europe (Dahmen et al. 306 2012) and in some humans infected with S. enterica (Cloeckaert et al. 2010), highlighting the international 307 role of these mobile elements in CTX-M-1 epidemiology. In addition to plasmid promiscuity, the spread of 308 CTX-M determinants is also favored by flanking transposable elements, which can co-mobilise *bla* genes. 309 This is the case of ISEcp1 element, usually located immediately upstream  $bla_{CTX-M}$  and  $bla_{CMY-2}$  genes. 310 Occasionally, it appears truncated by other insertion sequences such as IS26 (Jouini et al. 2007), IS10 (Ben 311 Sallen et al. 2012) or IS5 (Maamar et al. 2016), which could affect the mobilization and/or the expression 312 of the β-lactamase gene (Lahlaoui et al. 2014, Maamar et al. 2016).

313

# 314 ESBL, PLASMID-MEDIATED AMPc AND CARBAPENEMASE PRODUCING *E. coli* IN ANIMAL315 DERIVED FOOD

316 There are a wide number of papers in Africa concerning the microbiological quality of different types of 317 food derived from FPA (milk, cheese, meat, eggs, etc). Most of them are focused on the detection of 318 pathogenic bacteria (especially E. coli 0157) in order to determine the rate of contamination of the studied 319 product (Bankole et al. 2014, Ombarak et al. 2016) or even to analyze the resistance and/or virulence 320 patterns of bacteria present in milk collected from cattle suffering mastitis (Ahmed et al. 2011, Kateete et 321 al. 2013). However, there are just a few articles regarding the prevalence and characterization of 322 ESBL/pAmpC E. coli among food-products derived from healthy animals in different countries of the 323 African continent. Remarkable data extracted from these reports is summarized below the dotted lines in 324 Table 1.

325 All the studies but two, which included different animal species (Jouini et al. 2007, Ben Slama et al. 2010), 326 were carried out on meat samples or swabs collected from poultry carcasses. This fact may be a reflection 327 of the religious and cultural factors which influence the diet of people in many African countries. General 328 prevalence of ESBL/pAmpC E. coli among meat products was an average of 16.3%, although the risk of 329 cross-contamination at the slaughterhouses should be considered. This percentage is significantly lower 330 than those reported in many European countries such as Spain (84%-93.3%) (Egea et al. 2012, Ojer-Usoz 331 et al. 2013) or the Netherlands (76.8%) (Overdevest et al. 2011), which may indicate that resistance rates 332 are higher in industrial large-scale meat production.

333 Figure 1B shows the diversity of ESBL/pAmpC types detected among poultry (chicken and turkey), beef 334 and sheep meat in different countries from Africa. Comparing with the distribution of enzymes detected 335 among E. coli isolates from faecal poultry microbiota, a higher percentage of CTX-M-14 was identified 336 among derived meat products. It is important to consider different factors that can help to understand these 337 differences. Firstly, it is difficult to elucidate the animal, human or environmental origin of the isolates due 338 to the fact that contamination could take place at all the stages of the food processing chain including 339 processing, packing and distribution. Moreover, there are studies that demonstrate the contribution of 340 imported meat from industrialized countries to the emergence of ESBL and multidrug resistant isolates in 341 developing countries (Schaumburg et al. 2014, Rasmussen et al. 2015). One of these works, carried out in 342 Ghana, showed a significantly higher rates of ESBL/pAmpC-E. coli in imported chicken meat (32.9%) 343 compared to locally reared chickens (13.9%). CTX-M-15 was the most frequently detected ESBL variant. 344 However, *bla*<sub>CTX-M-2</sub> was also identified in two samples, one of them from an imported chicken thigh from 345 Brazil, where this CTX-M enzyme is well known to be the most prevalent, together with CTX-M-15, among 346 clinical isolates (Rocha et al. 2016). In the other study, conducted in Gabon, only imported frozen chicken 347 meat samples were screened and a predominance of CTX-M-14, followed by CTX-M-1, was detected. 348 Interestingly, all ESBL-E. coli isolates were identified in meat imported from Spain and, consequently, the 349 distribution of ESBL-type was shown to be in accordance to the proportion of CTX-M subtypes described 350 in this country (Egea et al. 2012, Ojer-Usoz et al. 2013).

Regarding studies on food from healthy animals, only two performed a molecular study of the clonal lineages associated with the spread of ESBLs (Jouini *et al.* 2013, Rasmussen *et al.* 2015). Considering data from both reports, a high clonal diversity was observed, being slightly prevalent *E.coli* isolates belonging to ST155, ST10 and ST38. These sequence types have been previously identified in humans and livestock animals (Ben Sallem *et al.* 2012a, Day *et al.* 2016), also associated to CTX-M-1 group ESBLs, suggesting
a potential implication of the food chain in the spread of these resistant clones among different settings.

357 Although none of the studies performed in Africa have reported carbapenemase-producing E. coli isolates 358 among food derived from livestock animals, it is important to highlight the detection of twelve NDM-359 producing Klebsiella isolates in retail chicken meat samples from Egypt (Abdallah et al. 2015). Moreover, 360 a recent study conducted in the same country has demonstrated a high rate of carbapenemase-producing 361 Klebsiella pneumoniae strains, harboring bla<sub>NDM</sub>, bla<sub>OXA-48</sub> and/or bla<sub>KPC</sub> genes in broiler chickens (35%), drinking water (25%) and humans living in contact with chickens (56%) (Hamza et al. 2016). Further 362 363 studies based on multilocus sequence typing (MLST) or whole-genome sequencing should be performed 364 to determine the potential inter-host transmission of these strains through direct contact and/or ingestion of 365 derived contaminated meat.

366

## 367 CONCLUSIONS

368 The increasing rate of antimicrobial resistance bacteria is a global problem that affects both human and 369 animal ecosystems. In the African region, the real magnitude of this issue is difficult to estimate due to the 370 fact that antimicrobial resistance surveillance programmes are limited to a few countries (Ndihokubwayo 371 et al. 2013). The potential inter-host spread of resistant clones or even their encoding determinants through 372 direct contact or ingestion of contaminated food pose a worrisome public health risk. Although in the last 373 decade the number of surveys in Africa has increased, available information is still scarce in many 374 countries, especially in Southern and Eastern Africa. Moreover, further molecular studies are required to 375 characterize the prevailing clonal lineages and plasmids harboring resistance encoding genes in this 376 continent. The combination of factors such as the uncontrolled use of antimicrobials in livestock 377 production, certain farming practices and manure management systems as well as close contact with animal 378 may favor the selection of AMR bacteria and transmission from animals to humans and vice versa. 379 Additionally, international livestock and derived meat trade is leading to an emergence in the dissemination 380 of resistant strains and genetic determinants. Resistance to "old" antimicrobials, such as tetracycline, 381 penicillins or sulphonamides, which has been in use for a long time both in human and veterinary medicine 382 is not surprising. However, in the last years a significant increase in the prevalence of resistance to other clinically critical drugs (i.e. quinolones and 3<sup>rd</sup>/4<sup>th</sup> generation cephalosporins) has been reported among 383 384 commensal E. coli from healthy livestock species. In most cases, resistance to both antimicrobial families

- is co-selected and disseminated not only by clonal spread, but also horizontally via plasmids carrying qnr
- 386 or *aac(6)lb-cr* and *bla* genes (especially, of the CTX-M group). Worryingly, carbapenem and colistin
- 387 resistant *E. coli* strains are also emerging among husbandry animals in Africa, which demonstrate the urgent
- 388 need of a better control of the usage of veterinary drugs and the implementation of effective surveillance
- 389 programmes to stop the dissemination of MDR *E. coli* strains.
- 390

# 391 REFERENCES

- Aarestrup, F.M., Wegener, H.C. and Collignon, P. (2008) Resistance in bacteria of the food chain:
  epidemiology and control strategies. *Expert Rev Anti Infect Ther* 6, 733-750.
- 394 Abdallah, H.M., Reuland, E.A., Wintermans, B.B., Al Naiemi, N., Koek, A., Abdelwahab, A.M., Ammar,
- 395 A.M., Mohamed, A.A. and Vandenbroucke-Grauls, C.M.J.E. (2015) Extended-spectrum β-lactamases
- and/or carbapenemases-producing Enterobacteriaceae isolated from retail chicken meat in Zagazig, Egypt.
- **397** *PLos One* **10**, e0136052.
- Adelowo, O.O., Fagade, O.E. and Agersø,Y. (2014) Antibiotic resistance and resistance genes in *Escherichia coli* from poultry farms, sothwest Nigeria. *J Infect Dev Ctries* 8, 1103-1112.
- 400 Adenipekum, E.O., Jackson, C.R., Oluwadun, A., Iwalokun, B.A., Frye, J.G., Barrett, J.B., Hiott, L.M. and
- 401 Woodley, T.A. (2015) Prevalence and Antimicrobial Resistance in *Escherichia coli* from food animals in
- 402 Lagos, Nigeria. *Microb Drug Resist* 21, 358-365.
- 403 Adesokan, H.K., Akanbi, I.O., Akanbi, I.M. and Obaweda, R.A. (2015) Pattern of antimicrobial usage in
- 404 livestock animals in south-western Nigeria: The need for alternative plans. Onderstepoort J Vet Res 82,
- 405 816.
- 406 Ahmed, A.M. and Shimamoto, T. (2011) Molecular characterization of antimicrobial resistance in Gram-
- 407 negative bacteria isolated from bovine mastitis in Egypt. *Microbial Immunol* 55, 318-327.
- 408 Ahmed, A.M., Shimamoto, T. and Shimamoto, T. (2013) Molecular characterization of multidrug-resistant
- 409 avian pathogenic *Escherichia coli* isolated from septicemic broilers. *Int J Med Microbiol* **303**, 475-483.
- 410 Aibinu, I., Odugbemi, T., Koenig, W. and Ghebremedhin, B. (2012) Sequence type ST131 and ST10
- 411 complex (ST617) predominant among CTX-M-15-producing *Escherichia coli* isolates from Nigeria. Clin
- 412 Microbiol Infect 18, E49-51.

- 413 Alghoribi, M.F., Gibreel, T.M., Famham, G., Al Johani, S.M., Balkhy, H.H. and Upton, M. (2015)
- 414 Antibiotic-resistant ST38, ST131 and ST405 strains are the leading uropathogenic *Escherichia coli* clones
- 415 in Riyadh, Saudi Arabi. *J Antimicrob Chermother* **70**, 2757-2762.
- 416 Ateba, C.N. and Bezuidenhout, C.C. (2008) Characterisation of *Escherichia coli* O157 strains from humans,
- 417 cattle and pigs in the Noth-West Province, South Africa. *Int J Food Microbiol* **128**, 181-188.
- 418 Bankole, H.S., Dougnon, V.T., Johnson, R.C., Dougnon, T.J., Yehouenou, B., Kougblenou, S., Agonsa,
- 419 M., Dadie, T. and Baba-Moussa, L. (2014) Assessment of the contamination of some foodstuffs by
- 420 Escherichia coli O157 in Benin, West Africa. Int J Microbiol 2014: 417848.
- 421 Baron, S., Jouy, E., Larvor, E., Eono, F., Bougeard, S. and Kempf, I. (2014) Impact of third-generation-
- 422 cephalosporin administration in hatcheries on fecal *Escherichia coli* antimicrobial resistance in broilers and
- 423 layers. Antimicrob Agents Chemother 58, 5428-5434.
- 424 Barguigua, A., El Otmani, F., Talmi, M., Zerouali, K. and Timiniouni, M. (2013) Prevalence and types of
- 425 extended spectrum β-lactamases among urinary *Escherichia coli* isolates in Moroccan community. *Microb*
- 426 *Pathog* 61-62: 16-22.
- 427 Belmahdi, M., Bakour, S., Al Bayssari, C., Touati, A. and Rolain J.M. (2016) Molecular characterisation
- 428 of extended-spectrum β-lactamase- and plasmid AmpC-producing *Escherichia coli* strains isolated from

429 broilers in Béjaïa, Algeria. *J Glob Antimicrob Resist* 6, 108-112.

- 430 Ben Sallem, R., Ben Slama, K., Estepa, V., Jouini, A., Gharsa, H., Klibi, N., Sáenz, Y., Ruiz-Larrea, F.,
- 431 Boudabous, A. and Torres, C. (2012) Prevalence and characterisation of extended-spectrum beta-lactamase
- 432 (ESBL)-producing Escherichia coli isolates in healthy volunteers in Tunisia. Eur J Clin Microbiol Infect
- 433 *Dis* **31**, 1511-1516.
- 434 Ben Sallem, R., Ben Slama, K., Sáenz, Y., Rojo-Bezares, B., Estepa, V., Jouini, A., Gharsa, H., Klibi, N.,
- 435 Boudabous, A. and Torres, C. (2012) Prevalence and characterization of extended spectrum beta-lactamase
- 436 (ESBL)- and CMY-2-producing *Escherichia coli* isolates from heatly food-producing animals in Tunisia.
- 437 Foodborne Pathogen Dis 9, 1137-142.
- 438 Ben Sallem, R., Ben Slama, K., Rojo-Bezares, B., Porres-Osante, N., Jouini, A., Klibi, N., Boudabous, A.,
- 439 Sáenz, Y. and Torres, C. (2014) Incl1 plasmids carrying bla(CTX-M-1) or bla (CMY-2) genes in
- 440 *Escherichia coli* from healthy humans and animals in Tunisia. *Microb Drug Resist* **20**, 495-500.
- 441 Ben Slama, K., Jouini, A., Ben Sallem, R., Somalo, S., Sáenz, Y., Estepa, C., Boudabous, A. and Torres.,
- 442 C. (2010) Prevalence of broad-spectrum cephalosporin-resistant *Escherichia coli* isolates in food samples

- 443 in Tunisia, and characterization of integrons and antimicrobial resistance mechanisms implicated. Int J
- 444 *Microbiol Food* **137**, 281-286.
- 445 Ben Slama, K., Ben Sallen, R., Jouini, A., Rachid, S., Moussa, L., Sáenz, Y., Estepa, V., Somalo, S.,
- 446 Boudabous, A. and Torres, C. (2011) Diversity of genetic lineages among CTX-M-15 and CTX-M-14-
- 447 producing *Escherichia col*i strains in a Tunisian hospital. *Curr Microbiol* **62**, 1794-1801.
- 448 Braun, S.D., Ahmed, M.F.E., El-Adawi, H., Hotzel, H., Engelmann, I., Weiβ, D., Monecke, S. and Ehricht,
- 449 R. (2016) Surveillance of extended-spectrum beta-lactamase-producing Escherichia coli in dairy cattle
- 450 farms in the Nile Delta, Egypt. *Front Microbiol* **7**, 1020.
- 451 Cantas, L., Shah, S.Q.A, Cavaco, L.M., Manaia, C.M., Walsh, F., Popowska, M., Garelick, H., Bürgmann,
- 452 H. and Sørum, H. (2013) A brief multi-disciplinary review on antimicrobial resistance in medicine and its
- 453 linkage to the global environmental microbiota. *Front Microbiol* **4**, 96.
- 454 Chantziaras, I., Boyen, F., Callens, B. and Dewulf, J. (2014) Correlation between veterinary antimicrobial
- use and antimicrobial resistance in food-producing animals: a report on seven countries. *J Antimicrob Chemother* 69, 827-834.
- 457 Chishimba, K., Hang'ombe, B.M., Muzandu, K., Mshana, S.E., Matee, M.I., Nakajima, C. and Suzuki, Y.
- 458 (2016) Detection of extended-spectrum beta-lactamase-producing Escherichia coli in market-ready
- 459 chickens in Zambia. Int J Microbiol 2016: 5275724.
- 460 Chouchani, C., Marrakchi, R., Ferchichi, L., El Salabi, A. and Walsh T.R. (2011) VIM and IMP metallo-
- 461 β-lactamases in *Escherichia coli* and *Klebsiella pneumoniae* from environmental samples in a Tunisian
- 462 hospital. *APMIS* **119**, 725-732.
- 463 Cloeckaert, A., Praud, K., Lefevre, M., Doublet, B., Pardos, M., Granier, S.A., Brisabois, A. and Weill,
- 464 F.X. (2010) IncI1 plasmid carrying extended-spectrum β-lactamase gene *bla*<sub>CTX-M-1</sub> in *Salmonella enterica*
- isolates from poultry and humans in France, 2003 to 2008. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* **54**, 4484-4486.
- 466 Dahmen, S., Bettaieb, D., Mansour, W., Boujaafar, N., Bouallèque, O. and Arlet, G. (2010)
- 467 Characterization and molecular epidemiology of extended-spectrum beta-lactamases in clinicla isolates of
- 468 Enterobacteriaceae in a Tunisian University Hospital. *Microb Drug Resist* 16, 163-170.
- 469 Dahmen, S., Haenni, M. and Madec, J.Y. IncI1/ST3 plasmids contribute to the dissemination of the *bla*<sub>CTX</sub>.
- 470 <sub>M-1</sub> gene in *Escherichia coli* from several animal species in France. *J Antimicrob Chemother* 67, 3011-3012.
- 471 Day, M.J., Rodríguez, I., van Essen-Zandbergen, A., Dierikx, C., Kadlec, K, Schink, A.K., Wu, G.,
- 472 Chattway, M.A., DoNascimento, V., Wain, J., Helmuth, R., Guerra, B., Schwarz, S., Threlfall, J.,

- 473 Woodward, M.J., Coldham, N., Mevius, D. and Woodford, N. (2016) Diversity of STs, plasmids and ESBL
- 474 genes among *Escherichia coli* from humans, animals and food in Germany, the Netherlands and the UK. J

475 *Antimicrob Chemother* **71**, 1178-1182.

- 476 Donkor, E.S., Newman, M.J., Yeboah-Manu, D. (2012) Epidemiological aspects of non-human antibiotic
- 477 usage and resistance: implications for the control of antibiotic resistance in Ghana. *Trop Med Int Health*
- **478 17**, 462-468.
- 479 Eager, H., Swan, G. and van Vuuren, M. (2015) A survey of antimicrobial usage in animals in South Africa
  480 with specific reference to food animals. *J S Afr Vet Assoc* 83, 16.
- 481 Egea, P., López-Cerero, L., Torres, E., Gómez-Sánchez, M del C., Serrano, L., Navarro Sánchez-Ortiz,
- 482 M.D., Rodríguez-Baño, J. and Pascual, A. (2012) Increased raw poultry meat colonization by extended
- 483 spectrum beta-lactamase-producing *Escherichia coli* in the south of Spain. Int J Food Microbiol 159, 69-
- **484** 73.
- 485 Fashae, K., Ogunsola, F., Aarestrup, F.M. and Hendriksen, R.S. (2010) Antimicrobial susceptibility and
- serovars of *Salmonella* from chickens and humans in Ibadan, Nigeria. *J Infect Dev Ctries* **4**, 484-494
- 487 Fortini, D., Fashae, K., García-Fernández, A., Villa, L. and Carattoli, A. (2011) Plasmid-mediated
- quinolone resistance and β-lactamases in *Escherichia coli* from healthy animals from Nigeria. *JAC* 66,
  1269-1272.
- 490 Grami, R., Mansour, W., Dahmen, S., Mehri, W., Haenni, M., Aouni, M. and Madec, J.Y. (2013) The
- 491 *bla*CTX-M-1 IncI1/ST3 plasmid is dominant in chickens and pets in Tunisia. *J Antimicrob Chemother* 68,
  492 2950-2952.
- 493 Grami, R., Dahmen, S., Mansour, W., Mehri, W., Haenni, M., Aouni, M. and Madec, J.Y. (2014) blaCTX-
- 494 M-15-carrying F2:A-:B- plasmid in *Escherichia coli* from cattle milk in Tunisia. *Microb Drug Resis* 20,
  495 344-349.
- 496 Grami, R., Mansour, W., Mehri, W., Bouallègue, O., Boujaâfar, N., Madec, J.Y. and Haenni, M. (2016)
- 497 Impact of food animal trade on the spread of *mcr*-1-mediated colistin resistance. *Euro Surveill* 21,
- 498 pi=30144. DOI: 10.2807/1560-7917.
- 499 Grave, K., Torren-Edo, J. and Mackay, D. (2010) Comparison of the sales of veterinary antibacterial agents
- 500 between 10 European Countries. *J Antimicrob Chemother* **65**, 2037-2040.

- 501 Haenni, M., Poirel, L., Kieffer, N., Châtre, P., Saras, E., Métayer, V., Dumoulin, R., Nordmann, P. and
- 502 Madec, J.Y. (2016) Co-occurrence of extended spectrum  $\beta$  lactamase and MCR-1 encoding genes on
- 503 plasmids. *Lancet Infect Dis* 16, 281-282.
- 504 Hamza, E., Dorgham, S.M. and Hamza, D.A. (2016) Carbapenemase-producing Klebsiella pneumoniae in
- 505 broiler farming in Egypt. *J Glob Antimicrob Resist* 7, 8-10.
- Hao, H., Cheng, G., Igbal, Z., Ai, X., Hussain, H.I., Huang, L., Dai, M., Wang, Y., Liu, Z. and Yuan, Z.
- 507 (2014) Benefits and risks of antimicrobial use in food-producing animals. *Front Microbiol* **5**: 288.
- 508 Hosoi, Y., Asai, T., Koike, R., Tsuyuki, M. and Suqiura, K. (2013) Use of veterinary antimicrobail agents
- 509 from 2005 to 2010 in Japan. Int J Antimicrob Agents **41**, 489-490.
- 510 Inwezerua, C., Mendoça, N., Calhau, V., Dominques, S. Adeleke, O.E. and Da Silva, G.J. (2014)
- 511 Occurrence of extended-spectrum beta-lactamases in human and bovine isolates of *Escherichia coli* from
- 512 Oyo state, Nigeria. J Infect Dev Ctries 8, 774-779.
- 513 Iweriebor, B.C., Iwu, C.J., Obim, L.B., Nwodo, U.U. and Okoh, A.I (2015) Multiple antibiotic resistances
- 514 among shiga toxin producing *Escherichia coli* O157 in feces of dairy cattle farms in Eastern Cape of South
- 515 Africa. BMC Microbiol 15, 213.
- Jouini, A., Vinué, L., Slama, K.B., Sáenz, Y., Klibi, N., Hammami, S., Boudabous, A. and Torres, C. (2007)
- 517 Characterization of CTX-M and SHV extended-spectrum beta-lactamases and associated resistance genes
- 518 in *Escherichia coli* strains of food samples in Tunisia. *J Antimicrob Chemother* **60**, 1137-1141.
- 519 Jouini, A., Slama, K.B., Klibi, N., Sallem, R.B., Estepa, V., Vinué, L., Ruiz-Larrea, F., Boudabous, A. and
- 520 Torres, C. (2013) Lineages and virulence gene content among extended-spectrum β-lactamase producing
- 521 *Escherichia coli* strains of food origin in Tunisia. *J Food Prot* **76**, 323-327.
- 522 Kateete, D.P., Kabugo, U., Baluku, H., Nyakarahuka, L., Kyobe, S., Okee, M., Najjuka, C.F. and Joloba
- 523 M.L. (2013) Prevalence and antimicrobial susceptibility patterns of bacteria from milkmen and cows with
- 524 clinical mastitis in and around Kampala, Uganda. *PLos One* **8**, e63413.
- 525 Kilani, H., Abbassi, M.S., Ferjani, S., Mansouri, R., Sghaier, S., Ben Salem, R., Jaouani, I., Douja, G.,
- 526 Brahim, S., Hammami, S., Ben Chehida, N. and Boubaker, I.B. (2015) Occurrence of bla CTX-M-1, qnrB1
- 527 and virulence genes in avian ESBL-producing Escherichia coli isolates from Tunisia. Front Cell Infect
- **528** *Microbiol* **5**, 38.
- 529 Lahlaoui, H., Ben Haj Khalifa, A., Ben Moussa, M. (2014) Epidemiology of Enterobacteriaceae producing
- 530 CTX-M type extended spectrum  $\beta$ -lactamase (ESBL). *Med Mal Infect* **44**, 400-404.

- 531 Leski, T.A., Bangura, U., Jimmy, D.H., Ansumana, R., Lizewski, S.E., Li, R.W., Stenger, D.A., Taitt, C.R.
- and Vora, G.J. (2013) Identification of *bla*OXA-51, *bla*OXA-58, *bla*DIM-1 and *bla*VIM carbapenemase
- 533 genes in hospital Enterobacteriaceae isolates from Sierra Leone. *J Clin Microbiol* **51**, 2435-2438.
- 534 Luanda, C.M., Buza, J., Mwanyika, G., Lyimo, B., Mrutu, R., Call, D.R. and Subbiah, M. (2016) Bacterial
- 535 contamination of pork carcasses from Arusha, Tanzania. *GJAR* **3**, 806-817.
- 536 Maamar, E., Hammami, S., Alonso, C.A., Dakhli, N., Abbassi, M.S., Ferjani, S., Hamzaoui, Z., Saidani,
- 537 M., Torres, C. and Boutiba-Ben Boubaker, I. (2016) High prevalence of extended-spectrum and plasmidic
- 538 AmpC beta-lactamase-producing *Escherichia coli* from poultry in Tunisia. Int J Food Microbiol 231, 69-
- 539 75.
- 540 Mainda, G., Bessell, P.R., Muma, J.B., McAteer, S.P., Chase-Topping, M.E., Gibbons, J., Stevens, M.P.,
- 541 Gally, D.L. and deC Bronsvoort, B.M. (2015) Prevalence and patterns of antimicrobial resistance among
- 542 *Escherichia coli* isolated from Zambian dairy cattle across different production systems. *Sci Rep* **5**, 12439.
- 543 Maron, D.F., Smith, T.J. and Nachman, K.E. (2013) Restrictions on antimicrobial use in food animal
- production: An international regulatory and economic survey. *Global Health* **9**, 48.
- 545 Meguenni, N., Le Devendec, L., Jouy, E., Le Corvec, M., Bounar-Kechih, S., Rabah Bakour, D. and Kempf,
- 546 I. (2015) First description of an extended-spectrum cephalosporin- and fluoroquinolone-resistant avian
- 547 pathogenic *Escherichia coli* clone. *Avian Dis* 59, 20-23.
- 548 Mezhoud, H., Boyen, F., Touazi, L.H., Garmyn, A., Moula, M., Smet, A., Haesbrouck, F., Martel, A.,
- 549 Iguer-Ouada, M. and Touati, A. (2015) Extended-spectrum β-lactamase producing *Escherichia coli* in
- broiler breeding roosters: Presence in the reproductive tract and effect on sperm motility. *Anim Reprod Sci* **159**, 205-211.
- 552 Mnif, B., Ktari, S., Rhimi, F.M. and Hammami, A. (2012) Extensive dissemination of CTX-M-1 and CMY-
- 553 2-producing *Escherichia coli* in poultry farms in Tunisis. *Lett Appl Microbiol* 55, 407-413.
- 554 Moquet, O., Bouchiat, C., Kinana, A. Seck, A., Arouna, O., Bercion, R., Breurec, S. and Garin, B. (2011)
- 555 Class D OXA-48 carbapenemase in multidrug-resistant enterobacteria, Senegal. *Emerg Infect Dis* **17**, 143-
- **556** 144.
- 557 Mrutu, R., Luanda, C., Rugumisa, B., Mwanyika, G., Subbiah, M., Call, D.R. and Buza, J. (2016) Detection
- 558 of microbial surface contamination and antibiotic resistant Escherichia coli on beef carcasses in Arusha,
- 559 Tanzania. Afr J Microbiol Res 10, 1148-1155.

- 560 Mshana, S.E., Falgenhauer, L., Mirambo, M.M., Mushi, M.F., Moremi, N., Julius, R., Seni, J., Imirzalioglu,
- 561 C., Matee, M. and Chakraborty, T. (2016) Predictors of blaCTX-M-15 in varieties of Escherichia coli
- 562 genotypes from humans in community settings in Mwanza, Tanzania. *BMC Infect Dis* 16, 187.
- 563 Mushi, M.F., Mshana, S.E., Imirzalioglu, C. and Bwanga F. (2014) Carbapenemase genes among multidrug
- resistant Gram negative clinical isolates from a tertiary hospital in Mwanza, Tanzania. Biomed Res Int
- **2014**:303104.
- 566 Ndihokubwayo, J.B., Yahaya, A.A., Desta, A.T., Ki-Zerbo, G., Asamoah-Odei, E., Keita, B., Pana, A.P.
- and Nkhoma, W. (2013) Antimicrobial resistance in the African Region: Issues, challenges and actions
- 568 proposed. African Heal Monit 16, 27-30.
- 569 Odwar, J.A., Kikuvi, G., Kariuki, J.N. and Kariuki, S. (2014) A cross-sectional study on the microbiological
- quality and safety of raw chicken meats sold in Nairobi, Kenya. BMC Res Notes 7, 627.
- 571 Ogbolu, D.O., Daini, O.A., Ogunledun, A., Alli, A.O. and Webber, M.A. (2011) High levels of multidrug
- 572 resistance in clinical isolates of gram-negative pathogens from Nigeria. Int J Antimicrob Agents 37, 62-66.
- 573 Olaitan, A.O., Chabou, S., Okdah, L., Morand, S. and Rolain J.J. (2016) Dissemination of the mcr-1 colistin
- 574 resistance gene. *Lancet Infect Dis* **16**, 147.
- 575 Olowe, O.A., Adewuni, O., Odewale, G., Ojurongbe, O. and Adefionye, O.J. (2015) Phenotypic and
- 576 molecular characterisation of extended-spectrum beta-lactamase producing *Escherichia coli* obtained from
- animal fecal samples in Ado Ekiti, Nigeria. *J Environ Public Health* **2015**: 497980.
- 578 Ombarak, R.A., Hinenoya, A., Awasthi, S.P., Iguchi, A., Shima, A., Elbagory, A.R. and Yamasaki, S.
- 579 (2016) Prevalence and pathogenic potential of *Escherichia coli* isolates from raw milk and raw cheese in
- 580 Egypt. Int J Food Microbiol 221, 69-76.
- 581 Ojer-Usoz, E., González, D., Vitas, A.I., Leiva, J., García-Jalón, I., Febles-Casquero, A. and Escolano, M
- 582 de L. (2013) Prevalence of extended-spectrum β-lactamase-producing Enterobacteriaceae in meat products
- sold in Navarra, Spain. *Meat Sci* 93, 316-321.
- 584 Ojo, O.E., Schwarz, S. and Michael, G.B. (2016) Detection and characterization of extended-spectrum β-
- 585 lactamase-producing Escherichia coli from chicken production chains in Nigeria. Vet Microbiol 194, 62-
- 586 68. DOI: 10.1016/j.vetmic.2016.04.022.
- 587 Overdevest, I., Willemsen, I., Rijnsburger, M., Eustace, A., Xu, L., Hawkey, P., Heck, M., Savelkoul, P.,
- 588 Vandenbroucke-Grauls, C., van der Zwaluw, K., Huisdens, X. and Kluytmans, J. (2011) Extended-

589 spectrum β-lactamase genes of *Escherichia coli* in chicken meat and humans, The Netherlands. *Emerg* 

590 Infect Dis 17, 1216-1222.

- Perreten, V., Strauss, C., Collaud, A. and Gerber, D. (2016) Colistin Resitance Gene *mcr*-1 in avian
  pathogenic *Escherichia coli* in South Africa. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* 60, 4414-4415.
- 593 Rasmussen, M.M., Opintan, J.A., Frimodt-Møller, N. and Styrishave, B. (2015) Beta-lactamse-producing
- 594 *Escherichia coli* isolates in imported and locally produced chicken meat from Ghana. *PLos One* **10**, 60139706.
- Reist, M., Geser, N., Hächler, H., Schärrer, S. and Stephan, R. (2013) ESBL-producing Enterobacteriaceae:
- 597 Ocurrence, risk factors for fecal carriage and strain traits in the swiss slaughter cattle population younger
  598 than 2 years sampled at abattoir level. PLos One, 8: e71725.
- 599 Rhouma, M., Beaundry, F., Thériault, W. and Letellier, A. (2016) Colistin in pig production: chemistry,
- 600 mechanism of antibacterial action, microbial resistance emergence, and One Health perspectives. *Front*
- 601 *Microbiol* **7**, 1789.
- 602 Robin, F., Aggoune-Khinache, N., Delmas, J., Naim, M. and Bonnet, R. (2010) Novel VIM metallo-β-
- lactamse variant from clinical isolates of Enterobacteriaceae from Algeria. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother*54, 466-470.
- Rocha, F.R., Pinto, V.P. and Barbosa, F.C. (2016) The spread of CTX-M-type extended-spectrum βlactamases in Brazil: A systematic review. *Microb Drug Resist* 22, 301-311.
- 607 Rugumisa, B.T., Call, D.R., Mwanyika, G.O., Mrutu, R.I., Luanda, C.M., Lyimo, B.M., Subbiah, M. and
- 608 Buza, J.J. (2016) Prevalence of antibiotic-resistant fecal *Escherichia coli* isolates from penned broiler and
- 609 scavenging local chickens in Arusha, Tanzania. *J Food Prot* **79**, 1424-1429.
- 610 Sangare, S.A., Maiga, A.I., Guindo, I., Maiga, A., Camara, N., Savadogo, S., Diallo, S., Bougoudogo, F.,
- 611 Armand-Lefevre, L., Andremont, A. and Maiga, I.I. (2015) Prevalence of extended-spectrum beta-
- 612 lactamse-producing Enterobacteriaceae isolated from blood cultures in Africa. *Med Mal Infect* **45**, 374-382.
- 613 Schaumburg, F., Alabi, A.S., Frielinghaus, L., Grobusch, M.P., Köck, R., Becker, K., Issifou, S., Kremsner,
- 614 P.G., Peters, G. and Mellmann, A. (2014) The risk to import ESBL-producing Enterobacteriaceae and
- 615 *Staphylococcus aureus* through chicken meat trade in Gabon. *BMC Microbiol* 14, 286.
- 616 Sekyere, J.O., Govinden, U. and Essack, S. (2016) The molecular epidemiology and Genetic Environment
- 617 of carbapenemases detected in Africa. *Microb Drug Resist* 22, 59-68.

- 618 Seni, J., Falgenhauer, L., Simeo, N., Mirambo, M.M., Imirzalioglu, C., Matee, M., Rweyemamu, M.,
- 619 Chakraborty, T. and Mshana, S.E. (2016) Multiple ESBL-producing Escherichia coli sequence types
- 620 carrying quinolone and aminoglycoside resistance genes circulating in companio and domestic farm

621 animals in Mwanza, Tanzania, harbor commonly occurring plasmids. *Front Microbiol* 7:142.

- 622 Soufi, L., Abbassi, M.S., Sáenz, Y., Vinué, L., Somalo, S., Zarazaga, M., Abbas, A., Dbaya, R., Khanfir,
- 623 L., Ben Hassen, A., Hammami, S. and Torres, C. (2009) Prevalence and diversity of integrons and
- 624 associated resistance genes in *Escherichia coli* isolates from poultry meat in Tunisia. *Foodborne Pathog*
- 625 Dis 6, 1067-1073.
- Storberg, V. (2014) ESBL-producing Enterobacteriaceae in Africa-a non-systematic literature review of
  research published 2008-2012. *Infect Ecol Epidemiol* 4.
- 628 Tadesse, D.A., Zhao, S., Tong, E., Ayers, S., Singh, A., Bartholomew, M.J. and McDermott, P.F. (2012)
- 629 Antimicrobial drug resistance in Escherichia coli from humans and food animals, United States, 1950-
- 630 2002. Emerg Infect Dis 18, 741-9.
- Tse, H. and Yuen, K.Y. (2016) Dissemination of the *mcr*-1 colistin resistance gen. *Lancet Infect Dis* 16, 145-146.
- 633 Van Boeckel, T.P., Brower, C., Gilbert, M., Grenfell, B.T., Levin, S.A., Robinson, T.P., Teillant, A. and
- Laxminarayan, R. (2015) Global trends in antimicrobial use in food animals. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 112,
  5649-5654.
- Van den Bogaard, A.E. and Stobberingh, E.E. (2000) Epidemiology of resistance to antibiotics. Links
  between animals and humans. *Int J Antimicrob Agents* 14, 327-335.
- 638 Wesonga, S.M., Muluyi, G.M., Okemo, P.O. and Kariuki, S. (2010) Antibiotic resistant salmonella and
- *Escherichia coli* isolated from indigenous *Gallus domesticus* in Nairobi, Kenya. *East Afr Med J* 87, 205210.
- 641 Yousfi, M., Touati, A., Mairi, A., Brasme, L., Gharout-Sait, A., Guillard, T. and De Champs, C. (2016)
- 642 Emergence of carbapenmase-producing *Escherichia coli* isolated from companion animals in Algeria.
- 643 *Microb Drug Resist* 22, 342-346.
- 644
- 645 *Conflicts of interest*: Do not exist in relation with this manuscript.
- 646
- 647

648 FIGURE LEGENDS:

649

650	Fig 1. Husbandr	y animal sp	becies (A)	and food	products (B	), prevalence	of ESBL/	pAmpC	producing	g E. coli
	0									

- 651 (%) and distribution of ESBL/pAmpC enzymes detected in the African continent. Prevalence at each
- 652 location was calculated considering the global data of published studies [prevalence (%)/number of samples
- 653 (number of studies considered at each location)]. ESBL/pAmpC enzymes are ordered, from left to right,
- with respect to its detection frequency. <sup>a</sup> Rectal samples from cattle (n=210) and environmental samples
- from the stalls (n=56) were considered. <sup>b</sup> Only a few samples were sequenced (n=25); <sup>c</sup> Imported and locally
- 656 produced chicken meat; <sup>d</sup> Imported chicken meat.

Study MLST Reference Region Country Animal species Type of sample **Detection test** Sample size ESBL/pAmpC-producing ESBL/pAmpC enzymes E. coli prevalence (%, of (% in relation with total nº of (number of ESBL/pAmpC-Period (number of producing E. coli isolates) animals) total animals/samples ESBL/pAmpC) tested) Northern Tunisia 2010 Chickens Double disk test 136 42 CTX-M-1 (58.2), CTX-M-15 (6.0), CMY-2 NS<sup>a</sup> (025b-ST131 clone Mnif et al. 2012 Faeces Africa PCR (37.3)discarded by PCR) Sequencing Double disk test 80 13.8 NS<sup>a</sup> Tunisia 2011 Sheep, chickens, Faeces CTX-M-1 (81.8), CMY-2 (18.2) Ben Sallem *et al.* 2012 cattle, horse, rabbit, PCR dromedaries Sequencing Tunisia 2013 Chickens Faeces Double disk test 65 26.1CTX-M-15 (88.2), CTX-M-1 (5.8), unknown NS<sup>a</sup> Kilani et al. 2015 PCR (5.8)Sequencing Tunisia 2013 Chickens Faeces Double disk test 137 35 CTX-M-1 (60.4), CTX-M-15 (10.4), CTX-M- ST2197 (9), ST58 (7), ST405 Maamar et al. 2016 14 (2.1), CMY-2 (27.1) PCR (6), ST155 (3), ST93 (3), Sequencing ST349 (3), ST542 (2), ST1196 (2), ST212 (2), ST117 (2), ST4968 (1), ST1431 (1), ST350 (1), ST1056 (1) NS<sup>a</sup> Chickens Gastrointestinal Double disk test 55.5 NS<sup>a</sup> Mezhoud et al. 2015 Algeria 9 CTX-M-type (100) and Reproductive PCR tracts Double disk test 61 32.8 Algeria 2014 Chickens Intestinal swabs SHV-12 (70), CTX-M-1 (10), CMY-2 (20) ST744 (4), ST38 (1), ST1011 Belmahdi et al. 2016 PCR (12), ST2179 (1), ST5086 (2) Sequencing Egypt 2014 Cattle Rectal swabs VITEK® 2 266 (210 from 42.8 CTX-M-15 (46.4), CTX-M-9 (2.7), TEM-type NS<sup>a</sup> Braun et al. 2016 cattle, 56 2.25 (carbapenemase-(40.5), SHV-type (0.4), CMY-type (9.9) Multiplex environmental producing E. coli) Carbapenemase encoding genes: OXA-48 microarray assays samples from the (83.3, n=5), OXA-181 (16.7, n=1) stalls) 2007 CTX-M-1 (60), CTX-M-14 (20), CTX-M-8 Jouini et al. 2007 Tunisia Chickens, cattle, Faeces/Meat Double disk test 78 12.8 (ESBLs were only NS<sup>a</sup> horses, turkeys, PCR detected in food samples, (10), SHV-5 (10) sheep, fishes Sequencing representing 26% of them) 2007 Double disk test 79 16.4  $NS^{a}$ Tunisia Chickens, turkeys, Meat CTX-M-1 (92.8), CMY-2 (7.2) Ben Slama et al. 2010 sheep, cattle, PCR fishes, horse Sequencing 0 NS<sup>a</sup> Tunisia 2009 Chickens, Turkeys Meat Double disk test 55 Soufi et al. 2009 PCR Double disk test 112 Egypt 2013 Chickens Meat 61.6% of the meat samples Among all Enterobacteria isolates: CTX-M-NS<sup>a</sup> Abdallah et al. 2015 PCR Enterobacteriaceae (10/38 E. coli isolates: 15 (63.8), other types belonging to CTX-M-1-(38 E. coli) 26.3%) group (4.3), CTX-M-9 group (2.9), SHV-type Sequencing (36.2)

Table 1. Summarize of data extracted from prevalence studies on ESBL/pAMPc producing E. coli in healthy husbandry animals and derived food products in Africa.

<sup>a</sup> NS: Not specified.

Region	Country	Study Period	Animal species	Type of sample	Detection test	Sample size (number of animals)	ESBL/pAmpC-producing <i>E. coli</i> prevalence (%, of total animals/samples tested)	ESBL/pAmpC enzymes (% in relation with total n° of ESBL/pAmpC)	MLST (number of ESBL/pAmpC- producing <i>E. coli</i> isolates)	Reference
Eastern Africa	Tanzania	2014	Sheep, goats, chickens, pigs, cattle, dogs	Rectal/Cloacal swabs	VITEK® 2 Whole-Genome Sequencing (25 ESBL- <i>E. coli</i> isolates)	600	20.8	Among the 25 sequenced ESBL- <i>E. coli</i> isolate: CTX-M-15 (100)	Among the 25 sequenced ESBL- <i>E. coli</i> isolate: ST617 (7; cattle, chicken, dog, pig), ST1303 (3; cattle, pig), ST2852 (3; pig, dog), ST131 (2; pig, dog)	Seni et al. 2016
	Zambia	2013-2014	Cattle	Faeces	-	376	0	-	-	Mainda et al. 2015
	Zambia	NSª	Chickens	Poultry swabs samples collected at the slaughterhouse	Double disk test PCR	384	20.1	CTX-M-type (92.2), SHV- type (9.1), TEM-type (29.9)	NS <sup>a</sup>	Chishimba et al. 2016
Western Africa	Ghana	2007	Humans, chickens, sheep, goats, pigs	Faeces	-	268	0	-	NS <sup>a</sup>	Donkor et al. 2012
	Nigeria	2006	Chickens, pigs	Faeces	PCR Sequencing	200	0.5	CTX-M-15 (100)	NS <sup>a</sup>	Fortini et al. 2011
	Nigeria	NS <sup>a</sup>	Cattle, pigs	Faeces	Double disk test PCR	350	20.57	CTX-M-type (70.8)	NS <sup>a</sup>	Olowe et al. 2015
	Nigeria	2009-2014	Chickens	Faeces/Meat	Double disk test PCR Sequencing	405	1 (ESBLs were only detected in chicken faeces, representing 1.4% of them)	CTX-M-15 (100)	ST10 (3), ST405 (1)	Ojo <i>et al.</i> 2016
	Gabon	2011-2012	Chickens	Meat (imported)	VITEK® 2 Double disk test PCR Sequencing (only CTX-M genes)	60	23.3	CTX-M-14 (35.3), CTX-M-1 (23.5), CTX-M-32 (5.9), SHV-type (41.2), TEM-type (35.3)	NSª	Schaumburg et al. 2014
	Ghana	NSª	Chickens	Meat (local/imported)	Double disk test PCR Sequencing	188	15.4	CTX-M-15 (34.5), CTX-M-1 (3.4), CTX-M-61 (3.4), CTX- M-1 group unknown subtype (10.3), CTX-M-2 group unknown subtype (6.9), blaCIT gene positive (not sequenced) (27.6), unknown ESBL/pAmpC enzyme (13.8)	ST38 (4), ST10 (2), ST354 (2), ST1158 (1), ST2167 (1), ST117 (1), ST4121 (1), ST542 (1), ST2461 (1), ST4120 (1), ST4028 (1), ST642 (1), ST162 (1), ST1304 (1), ST212 (1), ST124 (1), ST1431 (1), ST4122 (1), ST156 (1), ST155 (1), ST205 (1)	Rasmussen et al. 2015

<sup>a</sup> NS: Not specified.

Table 2. Distribution and clonal lineages of ESBL/pAMPc producing *E. coli* in sick husbandry animals in Africa

Country	Study Period	Animal species	Disease	Type of sample	Sample size (number of animals)	ESBL/pAmpC- producing <i>E. coli</i> prevalence (%, of total animals/samples/isolates tested)	ESBL/pAmpC enzymes (% in relation with total n° of ESBL/pAmpC)	MLST (number of ESBL/pAmpC- producing <i>E. coli</i> isolates)	Reference
Tunisia	2011-2012	Chickens	Colibacillosis	Faeces	193	4.1	CTX-M-1 (87.5), CTX- M-9 (12.5)	NS <sup>a</sup>	Grami et al. 2013
Tunisia	2010-2011	Chickens	Colibacillosis	Liver	60	0	-	-	Grami et al. 2014
		Cattle	Clinical mastitis	Milk	10	10	CTX-M-15 (100)	ST10(1)	
Algeria	2006-2011	Chickens	Colibacillosis	Internal organs (spleen, liver, pericardium, ovary)	NS <sup>a</sup> (220 <i>E. coli</i> isolates)	5	CTX-M-15 (100)	NS <sup>a</sup>	Meguenni <i>et al.</i> 2013
Egypt	2008	Cattle	Clinical and sub-clinical mastitis	Milk	86 (99 samples, 42 <i>E. coli</i> isolates)	0 (ESBL were detected among other gram- negative bacteria species)	-	-	Ahmed <i>et al.</i> 2011
Egypt	2011	Chickens	Septicemia	Heart blood	NS <sup>a</sup> (100 samples, 73 APEC isolates)	27.4	CMY-2 (55), CTX-M-15 (30), SHV-2 (15)	O25b-ST131 (3) (PCR assay)	Ahmed et al. 2013
Uganda	2010-2011	Cattle	Clinical mastitis	Milk	97 (97 samples, 12 <i>E. coli</i> isolates)	0	-	-	Kateete et al. 2013

<sup>a</sup> NS: Not specified.

